

Record of Executive Member Decision Taken Under the Scheme of Delegation	On
	30 July 2021

Title	Report of
Worden Hall Refurbishment - Contractor Appointment	Cabinet Member (Finance, Property and Assets)

Is this report confidential?	No
------------------------------	----

Purpose of the Report

1. To seek approval to appoint John Turner Construction to deliver the Worden Hall refurbishment works.

Recommendations

2. To appoint John Turner Construction through a JCT Standard Build Contract 2016 with Quantities, incorporating SRBC Standard Amendments.

Reasons for recommendations

3. John Turner Construction have demonstrated through a competitive tender process that has been evaluated on a price and quality basis, that they offer value for money, have the necessary skills and experience and that they will provide social value.

Other options considered and rejected

4. To award the contract to another contractor. This has been rejected as the robust competitive tender process has demonstrated that John Turner Construction offered the most economically advantageous tender.

Corporate outcomes

5. The report relates to the following corporate priorities: (tick all those applicable):

An exemplary council	✓	Thriving communities	✓
A fair local economy that works for everyone	✓	Good homes, green spaces, healthy places	✓

Background to the report

6. In June 2018, the Council appointed architectural consultant Purcell, and financial consultants Amion, to undertake a feasibility study and options appraisal into potential future uses for Worden Hall. A number of options were appraised and modelled in detail.
7. Council approved the development of a hybrid community use-based option at Cabinet in October 2018, following which a multi-disciplinary group of consultants developed the scheme for a planning application, which was approved in December 2020.
8. On 06 January 2021, Cabinet Member for Finance, Property and Assets approved a procurement strategy to deliver the design beyond planning and appoint a contractor to complete the works. The strategy recommended a re-tender of the professional services, completion of further technical surveys and a more intrusive review of the design to ensure it aligned with the business case and financial outputs. This process was completed and the new team in place by February 2020.
9. The procurement strategy also recommended use of a traditional procurement route for appointment of a contractor, to retain control of the design and costs due to the nature of refurbishment work. It was envisaged that this approach would generate maximum interest in the market. It was also recommended that an appropriate, OJEU compliant, framework was used. The tenders were to be evaluated on a 70% costs, 30% quality basis. Pass/Fail questions were included in the evaluation criteria for visiting the site and acceptance of the contract terms. The Quality questions included within the tender are detailed below:

Quality 30% of overall Score to include:

No	Criteria	Score	Weighting	Maximum Potential Score
1	<p><u>Construction Management Plan and Site Logistics</u></p> <p>Please provide a Construction Management Plan to demonstrate how you will safely manage and co-ordinate the works, focussing specifically on traffic management, site logistics, deliveries, access arrangements within the park, public safety and the impact on neighbouring businesses. Please provide detailed logistics plans and supporting information to demonstrate this</p> <p>(limited to 3 x A3 marked up plans and 2 sides of A4 text)</p>	0-5	2	10
2	<p><u>Social Value</u></p> <p>Please describe and quantify the social value outputs which would be delivered as a result of an appointment to deliver the Worden Hall scheme and in particular:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Local employment opportunities, including apprentice provision • Local supply chain engagement • Community engagement <p>(limited to 2 sides of A4 text)</p>	0-5	2	10
3	<p><u>Programme</u></p> <p>Please submit a full construction programme in Gantt chart format. The programme should describe in detail the processes you intend to follow to deliver all elements of the scheme. Identify key milestones including completion, snagging, commissioning and handover.</p>	0-5	1	5
4	<p><u>Specific Project Challenges – Refurbishment Experience</u></p> <p>Please provide details of your experience of traditional refurbishment projects, ideally with historic buildings. This should be in the form of 2 case studies and linking this experience to the proposed delivery team for Worden Hall.</p> <p>Given the above experience, please identify some of the key challenges and risks you can foresee with the Worden Hall project and how these could be managed and mitigated.</p>	0-5	1	5

10. Following a review of framework options, the RISE framework was selected to deliver a single stage tender process. An Expression of Interest process was completed, and the following contractors were selected from the framework:

- John Turner Construction (Preston)
- F Parkinson (Blackpool)
- Walter Carefoot (Preston)
- D&G Contractors (Chorley)
- Casey (Rochdale)

Tender Returns

11. Three tender responses were received. Two contractors declined to tender due to other commitments.

Cost Assessment

12. The prices submitted and the evaluated score (out of 70) are summarised below:

John Turner		Bidder 2		Bidder 3	
Cost	% Score	Cost	% Score	Cost	% Score
1,994,717.90	70.00	2,046,017.51	68.27	2,161,920.63	65.37

13. A full analysis of the bill of quantities was undertaken to ensure all activities have been included and a realistic price has been provided.

Qualitative Assessment

14. An assessment of the quality returns were undertaken against the quality questions. The moderated scores are provided below.

No	Criteria	Weighting	John Turner		Bidder 2		Bidder 3	
			Score	WS	Score	WS	Score	WS
1	Please provide a Construction Management Plan to demonstrate how you will safely manage and co-ordinate the works, focussing specifically on traffic management, site logistics, deliveries, access arrangements within the park, public safety and the impact on neighbouring businesses. Please provide detailed logistics plans and supporting information to demonstrate this	2	5	10	4	8	3	6
2	Please describe and quantify the social value outputs which would be delivered as a result of an appointment to deliver the Worden Hall scheme and in particular: •Local employment opportunities, including apprentice provision •Local supply chain engagement •Community engagement	2	5	10	3	6	3	6
3	Please submit a full construction programme in Gantt chart format. The programme should describe in detail the processes you intend to follow to deliver all elements of the scheme. Identify key milestones including completion, snagging, commissioning and handover.	1	4	4	4	4	3	3
4	Please provide details of your experience of traditional refurbishment projects, ideally with historic buildings. This should be in the form of 2 case studies and linking this experience to the proposed delivery team for Worden Hall. Given the above experience, please identify some of the key challenges and risks you can foresee with the Worden Hall project and how these could be managed and mitigated.	1	4	4	4	4	3	3
Total Weighted Score				28		22		18

15. John Turner Construction returned the highest moderated score with a total of 28 marks out of a possible 30 marks.

Cost and Qualitative Totals

16. The summary of the cost and qualitative moderated scores are as follows:

	John Turner	Bidder 2	Bidder 3
Cost Score	70.00	68.15	65.26
Quality Score	28	22	18
Total Score	98.00	90.15	83.26

17. On the basis that they achieved the highest overall moderated score it is recommended that John Turner Construction are appointed as Contractor to deliver

the Worden Hall project and a formal award confirmed in order that the mobilisation period can commence and the earliest start on site achieved.

18. John Turner Construction can demonstrate a proven and tested local supply chain, coupled with a direct labour force which compliments the needs of this particular scheme perfectly.

Financial

19. The constructions costs for the proposed appointed contractor added to the Council direct costs incurred such as design fees and surveys equates to £2,916,051.52, this includes a £250,000 contingency. This is in line with the report taken to Council on 21 July 2021 to approve an increased budget.

Programme

20. The programme submitted by John Turner Construction provides a start on site date of 16 August 2021 and a completion date of 06 May 2022. This programme allows the Worden Hall to be operational for the Leyland Festival on 02 June 2022.

Waive of Notice of Key Decision and Call In

21. To ensure the refurbishment works are completed for the Leyland festival in June 2022 a request to waive the key decision and call in on the contractor appointment has been agreed by the Chair of Scrutiny Committee and Mayor respectively.

Risk

22. A summary of the key risks are provided below:

Risk	Mitigating Measures
John Turner cannot meet the outlined programme	Earliest appointment to allow the start date to be met. Early dialogue to ensure a efficient start on site. Earliest sign off of approvals.
Delay in signing the Contract	Early engagement in finalising the contract
Availability of materials	Ensure John Turner allow sufficient lead in for material orders
Cost to deliver the scheme increases due to unidentified additional repairs	Contingency allowed within approved budget to address any unknowns.

Equality and diversity

23. N/A

Comments of the Statutory Finance Officer

24. The costs returned in the tender submission by the recommended contractor is within the revised budget provision of £2,917,090, including a £250,000 contingency, approved by Council on 21st July 2021.

Comments of the Monitoring Officer

25. Overall we are happy with what is proposed here.
26. The contract award follows a compliant tender process which has been detailed in the body of the report. Members can be satisfied that the award is reasonable.
27. It is noted that there have been approved requests to waive both the need to place this decision on the notice of key decisions and call-in. It is questionable whether this is a key decision as the value of this contract has been considered both at Cabinet in December of last year and Council more recently and it could be stated that the “key” element of the decision was considered then. However, as this relates to the awarding of the contract it is sensible to address the issue as proposed.
28. As this issue has been both before Cabinet, and indeed Full Council (in July this year), and for the urgency outlined in the report, to ensure delivery of the project prior to the commencement of the Leyland Festival in June 2022, it is reasonable to waive the call in period. It is clear that all members have been informed of the council intentions in this matter and recently had the opportunity to input.


Background documents

Council Report – Worden Hall – 21 July 2021

Cabinet Report – Worden Hall Project – 16 December 2020

Report Author:	Email:	Telephone:	Date:
Rachel Salter (Service Lead (Development and Business))	rachel.salter@southribble.gov.uk	01257 515 332	29 July 2021

Following careful consideration and assessment of the contents of this report, I approve the recommendation(s) contained within this report in accordance with my delegated power to make executive decisions.

Signed:	
	<i>Cllr Matthew Tomlinson (Cabinet Member for Finance, Property and Assets)</i>
Date:	30 July 2021
Publication Date (DSO use only):	30 July 2021

This decision will come into force and may be implemented five working days after its publication date, subject to being called in in accordance with the Council’s on.